Editorial Board

Editor
Lars Peter Laamann (SOAS, University of London), LL10@soas.ac.uk

Editorial Board Members
Nathan W. Hill (SOAS, University of London)
Ron Sela (Indiana University)
Agata Bareja-Starzyńska (University of Warsaw)
Wang Tao (Sothebys)
Aleksandr Naymark (Hofstra University)
Pamela Kyle Crossley (Dartmouth University)

Publisher
Harrassowitz Verlag, 65174 Wiesbaden, Germany

Subscriptions and access to electronic format
Please contact verlag@harrassowitz.de for queries concerning subscription rates and modalities. The Central Asiatic Journal can also be accessed electronically via JSTOR (www.jstor.org).

© Otto Harrassowitz GmbH & Co. KG, Wiesbaden 2019
This journal, including all of its parts, is protected by copyright. Any use beyond the limits of copyright law without the permission of the publisher is forbidden and subject to penalty. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations, microfilms and storage and processing in electronic systems.
Layout and typesetting: Dr. Petra Himstedt-Vaid
Printing and binding by © Hubert & Co., Göttingen
Printed on permanent/durable paper
Printed in Germany
www.harrassowitz-verlag.de
ISSN 0008-9192
Voices from ancient Dunhuang

Whereas the first issue of volume 61 was dedicated to Old Tibet, the present issue of the *Central Asiatic Journal* deals with cultural vestiges of the contiguous civilisations. As the astute reader will not fail to notice, once again Dunhuang emerges as a nodal point. In this outpost of the early Chinese empires, emissaries from the Asian West, India, Tibet, from Central Asia and southern Siberia and, not least, China in its various dynastic expressions would be exposed to each other in an enduring encounter. In this transcontinental caravanserai, a constant exchange of material wealth would be accompanied by the introduction of philosophical, religious and cultural concepts, outwardly represented by the mingling of music, garments and hair styles from an entire continent.

The “Dunhuang effect” could be felt far beyond this garrison-oasis itself. As the articles in the present issue demonstrate, the intercivilisational exchange stretched far into the Chinese world and throughout Central Asia. Irina Popova starts off by analysing a fragment discovered in the Dunhuang “School Cave”, part of educational material used in a local school in Dunhuang during the Tang period. The document is evidence how Confucian education had permeated even the westernmost parts of imperial China, including the Dunhuang “melting pot”. Chen Ruixuan expands on the Dunhuang theme in his study of texts written in Tocharian B. In contextualising this fragment, Buddhist purification practices known in Sanskrit as *dhutaguṇa* and in Pāli as *dhutaṅga* are analysed, thus shedding light on the religious-historical background and on its concrete function in this context. Using an intricate blend of archaeological, historical and numismatic evidence, Barakatullo Ashurov follows up with an analysis of coins as testimony of Sogdian Christianity (5th–9th c.). Sogdian traders were a most common sight in Dunhuang, whilst Sogdians played a crucial role within the armies of the Tang empire. Despite their use as currency for local commercial transactions, Sogdian coins bearing Christian motifs were thus a powerful reminder well beyond the boundaries of mediaeval Sogdiana of the economic, socio-cultural and religious impact this central Asian people had on the adjoining regions.

Hayrettin Erkoç exemplifies the centrality of Dunhuang in his study of a Tibetan document discovered by Pelliot in 1908 and kept today as P.T. 1283 in the Pelliot tibétain collection at the Bibliothèque nationale de France (Paris). Its three texts, one in Chinese, the other two in Tibetan, narrate myths belonging to the Türk (Түйүү, Göktürks) and Kyrgyz peoples. The myths allude to military prowess, exceptional creatures and to a collective descent from dogs or wolves – motifs which can also be found in other Turkic mythologies. The Turkic myths discovered in Dunhuang therefore reflect the confluence of a vast collection of Central Asian folk beliefs in this nodal point at the end of the Great Wall. Chen Hao combines quanti-
ative argumentation, in analogy with Chinese sources, in order to identify common markers of chronology in Old Turkic inscriptions. Whether the Chinese data is completely reliable in cases such as the Beş Balık Battle may be questionable, although the two sets of data by and large coincide. Michael Knüppel rounds off the articles of this issue of the CAJ by analysing the archaeological report compiled by G. F. Müller (1705–1783) after travelling through Siberia. First published in 1770 as “On the old tombs of Siberia”, Müller can be counted amongst the very first ethnographers. His multidisciplinary approach to analysing archaeological funeral sites leaves an almost modern impression. Müller’s attempts to connect the inscriptions found on stelae and statues with Mongol and Uighur influence could only much later, in the late 19th century, be disproven and ascribed to Göktürk civilisations. The present issue is completed by two reviews. The first one is Jürgen Wasim Frembgen’s review of Augusto Cacopardo’s Pagan Christmas, taking readers to the southern side of this journal’s remit, namely to the Kalasha people of the Hindu Kush. The second review, “An Untimely Pearl” by Kirill Solonin, allows us to re-approach Dunhuang by means of his analysis of Gerard Clauson’s Skeleton Tangut (Hsi Hsia) Dictionary – via the library of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London. A sincere word of gratitude also to my colleague Dr Petra Himstedt-Vaid, without whose patience the present issue would not have been possible. Thanks also to Mr Law Kwok Fai for proof-reading the Chinese entries.

This completes our visit to ancient “Greater Dunhuang”, which began in issue 1 with our investigation of old Tibet. If our readers have learned to appreciate the plurality of civilisational voices in ancient Central Asia, then volume 61 of the Central Asiatic Journal, in both of its issues, has indeed achieved its purpose.

Lars P. Laamann
March 2019
Contents

Abstracts ................................................................................................................ VII

Contributions

Irina F. POPOVA
Fragment of a Political Treatise in a Dunhuang School Manual ............. 199

CHEN Ruixuan 陳瑞翾
Vignettes of Buddhist Asceticism: Jottings on Six Fragments in Tocharian B . 217

Barakatullo ASHurov
Coins Convey a Message: Numismatic Evidence for Sogdian Christianity . 257

Hayrettin İhsan ERKOÇ
Elements of Turkic Mythology in the Tibetan Document P.T. 1283 .......... 297

CHEN Hao 陳浩
A Study on the Chronology of Old Turkic Inscriptions ......................... 313

Michael KNÜPPEL
Ein Bericht G. F. Müllers über archäologische Arbeiten und Funde
in Sibirien ............................................................................................................. 323

Book reviews

Jürgen Wasim FREMBGEN
Augusto S. Cacopardo, Pagan Christmas: Winter Feasts of the Kalasha of
the Hindu Kush .................................................................................................... 339

Kirill SOLONIN
An Untimely Pearl – Gerard Clauson, Skeleton Tangut (Hsi Hsia) Dictionary.
A Facsimile Edition with an Introduction by Imre Galambos, Editorial notes
and an Index by Andrew West, prepared for publication by Michael Everson . 341
Abstracts 摘要
Barakatullo ASHuroV

Coins Convey a Message: Numismatic Evidence for Sogdian Christianity

This article examines numismatic evidence and aims to enquire what can be said about the history of Christianity in mediaeval Sogdiana between the 5th and the 9th centuries. The article will focus on Sogdian coins displaying Christian iconography, especially the cross. The Christian semantic of the cross in Sogdian coins is analysed on the basis of a comparative art historical examination with other regions where the cross was used as a conventional symbol for Christianity. Rather than concentrating on its monetary value, the prime interest will be on the historical, socio-cultural and religious contexts of Sogdian coinage and its representative role in relation to Christianity. Sogdian coins bearing Christian motifs have been found at Varakhsha, Paykent, Qum-Sovtan, Afrāsiāb, Panjikent and Osrušana, and their circulation was putatively limited to the regions where they were discovered. Hence, they appear to have been local currencies, used for local commercial transactions.

貨幣內含的信息：錢幣作為粟特基督教的憑證

本文研究粟特貨幣的歷史，以及探索唐代中亞的早期基督教。它集中討論粟特貨幣如何展示基督教的十字架以及其他宗教藝術。粟特貨幣的十字架是以基督教語義被分析。因此本文主要著墨於歷史、社會、文化以及宗教方面，經濟方面是比較次要的。文章的地理範圍涵蓋彭吉肯特、沙赫里薩布茲、河中等這些發現上述貨幣的地區。因此，粟特錢幣可以被推斷為用作地方交易之用。

CHEN Hao 陳浩

A Study on the Chronology of Old Turkic Inscriptions

With a correct understanding of the usage of the calendar and the way of calculating age, we are able to establish a reliable chronology of the Bilge Kağan and Kül Tégin Old Turkic inscriptions. Through a comparative study of the Old Turkic inscriptions and the relevant Chinese sources, we can conclude that the two kinds of chronological data can only tally with each other in a broad sense. The two exceptions are the battle against General Çaça and the battle in Beş Balık, by which there is one-year-difference between the two kinds of sources. As to the Beş Balık Battle, if we take two crucial factors into consideration, then the one-year-difference will disappear. The first crucial factor is the asynchronous character of mediaeval society. For an event that had happened in the land of Türk, the date recorded in the Turkic inscrip-
tions was usually two months earlier than the date recorded in the Chinese sources, because it took supposedly around two months for the envoys to bring the news from Ötüken to the Tang court. The second crucial factor is that the Türk army might set off in late autumn or winter, as they wanted to take advantage of the frozen Yellow River to cross the border. However, as far as the battle against General Çaça is concerned, even if we take the above two factors into consideration, we can’t properly explain the one-year-difference between two different kinds of sources. We are inclined to believe that Bilge Kağan’s memory about the events that had happened in the early years of his life became blurred; meanwhile we don’t exclude the possibility that the Chinese annalists could have made a mistake. The single exception does not hurt the reliability of our reconstructed chronology.

古代突厥文碑年報研究
在正確理解曆法和計算年齡方法的基礎之上，我們成功地為古代突厥碑銘建立了一套編年體系。通過古代突厥碑銘與漢文史料的對照研究，我們得了兩者的編年數據基本吻合的結論，不過鳴沙戰役和北庭之戰尚需進一步解釋。表面上看，漢文史料與突厥碑銘在這兩起事件上有一年的出入，但如果我們把兩個因素考慮進去，就可以有效地解釋兩種史料中存在的一年“誤差”問題。這兩個因素分別是：一、就某一肇始於突厥汗國內部的事件而言，由於路途遙遠和交通不便，突厥碑銘中記載的日期往往比漢文史料中的日期要早兩個月左右；二、突厥軍隊出征唐朝的時間有可能選擇在歲末嚴冬。

CHEN Ruixuan 陳瑞翾
Vignettes of Buddhist Asceticism: Jottings on Six Fragments in Tocharian B

This paper consists of a disquisition on six fragments of an otherwise unknown text in Tocharian B, which centers on the Buddhist purification practices known as Skt. dhutaguṇa or Pāli dhutaṅga. Adopting a contextualist approach to the fragmentary text, which is translated and annotated in its entirety for the first time, this study draws on numerous textual sources and ethnographic records with reference to kin-
dred ideas and praxis in various strands of Buddhism and, it is hoped, sheds new light not only on the content and structure of this text per se but also on the religio-
historical context in which it was transmitted, and its function and purpose in that milieu.

佛教苦行僧的小插曲：六個吐火羅B文殘片的記錄
本文詳考龜茲語殘片六葉。所有這些殘片出自於一部以佛教頭陀行（梵語dhut
guṇa、巴利語dhutaṅga）為中心的文獻，孤本僅存。本文首次公佈該文獻殘篇完整的英譯及匯注；與此同時，採用語境論研究法，廣泛徵引佛教諸派所傳
聞涉頭陀行思想與實踐之資料，在探究該文獻的句法文脈之餘，試圖重構其宗教史語境及其在原生場域中之功用。
Elements of Turkic Mythology in the Tibetan Document P.T. 1283

The well-known Tibetan document P.T. 1283 is a unique historical source that contains significant information about mid-8th century Central Asia. Discovered at Dunhuang in 1908, P.T. 1283 is kept today in the collection Pelliot tibétain at the Bibliothèque nationale de France in Paris. One side of the document is in Chinese and the other side contains two different Tibetan texts. The title of the second Tibetan text, *Byang phyogs na rgyal po bzhugs pa’i rabs gyi yi geo* (BNP), was translated into English by Venturi as *Text on the sequence of however many kings live in the north*, containing several myths belonging to the Türk (Tujue, Göktürks) and Kyrgyz. In conclusion, the Turkic myths narrated in P.T. 1283 are reflections of a very large collection of Central Asian folk beliefs, exemplified in numerous historical sources.

Abstracts

Hayrettin İhsan ERKOÇ

A Report by G.F. Müller concerning archaeological work and finds in Siberia

The present article analyses the archaeological report compiled by Gerhard Friedrich Müller (1705–1783) after his travels through Siberia. Published anonymously in 1770 with the title “On the old tombs of Siberia”, Müller qualifies as one of the first ethnographers. In deducing the social status of interred persons by means of both the location of the grave and of the objects buried with the deceased, Müller adopted a multidisciplinary approach of a character that would almost be acceptable today. Müller also attempted to relate the inscriptions found on stelae and statues belonging to the graves with the two ethnic groups he was most familiar with, namely Mongols and Uighurs (“Igureers”). Only by the late 19th century their nature could firmly be identified as belonging to the Göktürk civilisations of the Yenissei and Orkhon.

Michael KNÜPPEL
Irina F. POPOVA

Fragment of a Political Treatise in a Dunhuang School Manual

The paper contains the translation and study of the fragment Дх-11656 from the collection of the Institute of Oriental Manuscripts, RAS, pertaining to educational material used in a local school in the vicinity of Dunhuang under the Tang and the Five Dynasties. The document bears the title *Wu chang* ("Five permanencies") and includes analyses of the categories *ren* (仁), *yi* (義), *li* (禮) and *zhi* (智) (the *xin* category is not included), key virtues on which Confucian education in China was based. The explanation of *zhi* ("wisdom") contains a political remonstrance by Wang Gui 王珪 (570–639), a dignitary of the Tang dynasty, addressed to Taizong, the second Tang emperor (r. 626–649), supplemented with the latter’s approving reply. This text was included in modified form in the famous work of Wu Jing 吳兢 (670–749) *Zhenguan zhengyao* 貞觀正要 ("Essentials of government of the Zhenguan Period"), which contains dialogues between Taizong and his chancellors on governance and ethics. The characteristics of the other noblemen from the beginning of the Tang era, such as Gao Shilian 高士廉, Hou Junji 侯君集, Zhang Gongjin 張公謹 and Wei Zheng 魏徵, appear in the same fragment. The use of a political treatise as teaching material in a remote locality is evidence of the high standard of formal education in China during the Tang dynasty.

敦煌文藏中的一份政治殘件

本文旨在研讀俄羅斯科學院東方研究所所藏的敦煌文獻之中一份相當有趣、編號為Дх-11656的文件，它是曾經被輯錄於唐代和五代時期一所學校的教材裡。這份殘件的標題為《五常》。由兩張紙組成，共有六十一行以楷書寫的文字，其下部分已不復存在，它曾在一九八十年代被復修過。文件內容分為兩部分，第一部份討論儒學五常之四項特質，即是仁、義、禮以及智（第五常‘信’並沒被探討）。第二部份由王珪紳士向唐太宗皇帝進諫時所呈的一份奏摺。Дх-11656這份文件最初被陸慶夫教授於二〇〇八年分析。陸教授同年發現此份文獻的內容原來屬於散佚多時的《太宗實錄》。本文介紹Дх-11656這份文獻的組成，並將其內容翻譯成英文。本文同時闡述唐太宗時代的歷史背景，包括剖析當時的國事及朝政，例如張公謹、高士廉、侯君集、魏徵以及王珪的被委派的任務榮耀。最後，本文會討論這份教材中的哲學內容在弘揚儒學方面所作出的貢獻。